

Appendix K

Minutes of the meeting with the Town Planning Board

**Minutes of 1034th Meeting of the
Town Planning Board held on 31.5.2013**

Present

Permanent Secretary for Development
(Planning and Lands)
Mr. Thomas Chan

Chairman

Professor S.C. Wong

Mr. F.C. Chan

Professor K.C. Chau

Mr. H.W. Cheung

Dr. Wilton W.T. Fok

Mr. Ivan C.S. Fu

Mr. Lincoln L.H. Huang

Professor Eddie C.M. Hui

Ms. Janice W.M. Lai

Mr. Dominic K.K. Lam

Dr. C.P. Lau

Ms. Julia M.K. Lau

Ms. Christina M. Lee

Mr. H.F. Leung

Mr. Clarence W.C. Leung

Mr. Laurence L.J. Li

Mr. Roger K.H. Luk

Ms. Anita W.T. Ma

Mr. Stephen H.B. Yau

Dr. W.K. Yau

Deputy Director of Environmental Protection
Mr. C.W. Tse

Director of Lands
Ms. Bernadette H.H. Linn

Principal Assistant Secretary (Transport)
Transport and Housing Bureau
Miss Winnie M.W. Wong

Assistant Director (2), Home Affairs Department
Mr. Eric K.S. Hui

Director of Planning
Mr. K.K. Ling

Deputy Director of Planning/District
Miss Ophelia Y.S. Wong

Secretary

Absent with Apologies

Mr. Stanley Y.F. Wong

Vice-chairman

Mr. Timothy K.W. Ma

Professor Edwin H.W. Chan

Ms. Bonnie J.Y. Chan

Mr. Rock C.N. Chen

Mr. Sunny L.K. Ho

Professor P.P. Ho

Mr. Patrick H.T. Lau

Mr. Maurice W.M. Lee

In Attendance

Assistant Director of Planning/Board
Ms. Christine K.C. Tse

Chief Town Planner/Town Planning Board
Mr. Edward W.M. Lo

Senior Town Planner/Town Planning Board
Mr. Raymond H.F. Au

Agenda Item 4

[Open Meeting]

Tung Chung New Town Extension Study – Stage 2 Public Engagement
(TPB Paper No. 9360)

[The meeting was conducted in Cantonese.]

35. The following Members had declared interests in this item:

Mr. Dominic K.K. Lam]	had business dealings with Ove Arup and
Mr. Ivan C.S. Fu]	Partners Hong Kong Limited (ARUP)
		which was the consultant of the study
Ms. Christina M. Lee	-	her company owned land/properties in Ma
		Wan Chung Village

36. As the item was mainly to solicit views from the Town Planning Board (the Board) on the initial land use options formulated for the Tung Chung New Town extension, Members agreed that the above Members should be allowed to stay in the meeting and participate in the discussion.

37. The following representatives from the government and the consultants were invited to the meeting at this point:

Mr. Ivan Chung	-	District Planning Officer/Sai Kung & Islands, Planning Department (DPO/SKIs, PlanD)
Mr. Bosco Chan	-	Deputy Project Manager (Hong Kong Island & Islands), Civil Engineering and Development Department (DPM, HKI&Is, CEDD)
Mr. David Lo	-	Chief Engineer/Islands (CE/Is), CEDD
Mr. C.K. Lam	-	Senior Engineer, CEDD
Ms. Theresa Yeung]	
Mr. Daman Lee]	ARUP
Miss Bess Cheng]	
Mr. Vincent Lai]	

Presentation Session

38. The Chairman extended a welcome and invited the study team to brief Members on the Tung Chung New Town Extension Study (the Study).

39. With the aid of a Powerpoint presentation, Mr. Ivan Chung, made the following main points on the background of the Study and the findings of the Stage 1 Public Engagement (PE) as detailed in the Paper:

Background

- (a) the overall objective of the Study was to identify the development potential and opportunities to extend Tung Chung into a distinct community which could meet housing, social, economic, environmental and local needs. Initially, Tung Chung East (TCE) and Tung Chung West (TCW) had been identified as the potential extension areas;
- (b) the Stage 1 PE of the Study was held from June to August 2012;

Summary of Key Public Views in Stage 1 PE

- (c) more than 2,300 written submissions were received and a questionnaire survey was conducted in Tung Chung. The public generally agreed that Tung Chung had a potential to be further developed, with broad consensus for a balanced development in terms of development intensity, environmental protection and social needs. Whilst there was no major objection to reclamation in TCE, there was a general preference for developing fallow agricultural land rather than reclamation in TCW. There was also a general view that in further developing TCW, the impacts on the ecology and environment of Tung Chung Bay and Tung Chung River should be minimised;
- (d) a number of key themes were reflected in the public views received: the further development of Tung Chung should strike a balance between private and public housing; more community, transportation and recreational facilities should be provided; the external connectivity of Tung Chung with other parts of Hong Kong should be improved; there should be better internal connectivity within Tung Chung with the provision of more and balanced distribution of community and recreational facilities; and increased job and business opportunities should be created for local residents;
- (e) there were suggestions for promoting commercial and tourism uses with the development of hotel/resort centres and marina. On heritage and nature conservation aspects, suggestions were received that monuments and historic buildings of preservation values should be protected, where appropriate, for educational and tourism purposes. Some suggested that rural villages should be respected and Ma Wan Chung should be revitalised. Suggestions were also received that opportunities should be explored for promoting eco-tourism and environmental education in TCW;
- (f) taking into account the relevant comments and suggestions from the public, as well as the planning and engineering considerations including the aviation issue, noise impact, preservation of cultural heritage and natural environment and constraints on reclamation extent etc, initial land use

options for TCE and TCW had been formulated for further discussion in the Stage 2 PE; and

Planning Principles

(g) the planning principles to guide the formulation of initial land use options were as follows:

(i) Meeting Housing Needs

- to help address territorial housing demand; and
- to provide a balanced housing mix;

(ii) Improving Connectivity

- to provide adequate transport infrastructure;
- to provide convenient access to existing town centre; and
- to promote environmentally friendly transport modes;

(iii) Providing Balanced Allocation of Facilities and Open Space

- to provide sufficient and easily accessible community facilities;
and
- to provide quality open space;

(iv) Promoting Economic Development

- to promote regional and local commercial activities; and
- to boost tourism appeal of Tung Chung;

(v) Adopting Sustainable Urban Design

- to integrate with natural topography and existing built form;
- to maximise waterfront potential; and
- to encourage a green and sustainable living environment;

(vi) Preserving Heritage and Ecology

- to preserve cultural heritage and high ecological value of TCW;
- to capitalise on the natural landscape; and

- to respect local villages.

40. With the aid of a Powerpoint presentation, Ms. Theresa Yeung, made the following main points on the proposed initial land use options as detailed in the Paper:

Proposed Initial Land Use Options

Reclamation Extent

- (a) the development potential of Tung Chung New Town could be further realised by extending it to its east and west. The direction of the extension was to provide land through reclamation in TCE, and to use fallow agricultural land and limited reclamation in TCW. Without reclamation, the further development potential at Tung Chung would be severely limited and there would be little scope to achieve the goals in accordance with the planning principles. The future extended Tung Chung New Town would be linked by railway and different road networks connecting to the surroundings areas and urban areas. Having regard to the engineering, environmental, traffic and ecological constraints of the Study Area, the extent of proposed reclamation in TCE and TCW would be about 120 ha in TCE and about 14 ha in TCW;

Key Planning and Urban Design Components

- (b) for all the initial land use options for TCE and TCW, there were some common planning and urban design components as enumerated below:
 - (i) two new MTR stations in TCE and TCW respectively to cater for the future population of the new town extension area and also to enhance the connectivity of the new town to other parts of the territory;
 - (ii) a transport oriented development (TOD) concept to allow maximum development intensity within 500m walking distance of the new

MTR stations, thus giving future residents a convenient access to the stations. Most of the areas with domestic plot ratios (PRs) 5 or 6 would fall within the 500m walking distance;

- (iii) waterfront promenade (about 20m to 40m wide) in TCE and TCW to form a distinctive component of Tung Chung coastal identity and also to operate as pedestrian walkway to enhance connectivity of the Study Area;
- (iv) north-south linear park (about 20m to 30m wide) with landscaped facilities in TCE to allow visual relief/corridors and to enhance air ventilation and pedestrian mobility amongst residential neighbourhoods, waterfront promenade and mass-transit facilities in a comfortable manner;
- (v) a town park (about 18 ha) to the east of Yat Tung Estate to integrate heritage and local culture into landscaped open space, to enhance existing pathways onto the elevated slopes and to provide additional pedestrian links from the park to the coast and Ma Wan Chung Village;
- (vi) stepped building height profile descending towards the waterfront to allow a better urban design configuration and to maximise view towards the sea from selected vantage points (including cultural/heritage sites);
- (vii) a balanced mix of public and private housing for the whole Tung Chung similar to the existing public to private housing ratio to create a harmonious community;
- (viii) areas of ecological importance along Tung Chung Bay and Tung Chung River to be preserved for conservation purpose; and
- (ix) government, institution and community (GIC) facilities and open

space to cater for the needs of the planned population in accordance with the Hong Kong Planning Standards and Guidelines (HKPSG). The distribution and location of the GIC facilities would be determined having regard to their services to be provided and accessibility to the neighbourhood. Low-rise GIC developments at suitable locations could also serve as visual and spatial relief to the built up areas;

Major Features of the Initial Land Use Options

Tung Chung East

- (c) approximately 120 ha of reclamation were proposed in TCE having taken into consideration the noise impact of future Tuen Mun – Chek Lap Kok Link, the high ecological value of Tai Ho Wan and the Tung Chung Navigation Channel. Two initial land use options for TCE were devised to meet different objectives and development needs:
 - (i) Theme 1: “Livable Town” – it was premised on the objective of helping to address the territorial housing demand. Based on the transport oriented development concept, residential areas within 500m walking distance from the proposed TCE Station would adopt domestic PR 5 and 6. Commercial uses were also planned around the station to cater for the needs of local residents and provide job and business opportunities for the future Tung Chung New Town. The mixed residential and commercial uses would form a Metro Core Area immediately next to the TCE Station. The domestic PR band was proposed to descend to PR 4 to the north and PR 3 near the waterfront. This option would produce about 38 000 flats (planned population of about 111 000) for TCE. Adequate land would be reserved for supporting GIC facilities including a sports ground in the eastern side of the proposed reclamation; and
 - (ii) Theme 2: “Economic Vibrancy” – together with the existing and

potential economic/tourism developments in northern Lantau, and taking account of its strategic location, TCE could readily become a commercial hub in the region. Under the “Economic Vibrancy” theme, more land would be reserved for commercial development and higher non-domestic PRs of 2.5 to 3 would be adopted at the Metro Core Area to help create more job and business opportunities for Hong Kong residents, particularly those living in Tung Chung. To create a regional commercial hub, about 450 000m² of floor area would be planned for office/regional retail/hotel uses in TCE. A marina with related land for commercial uses was also proposed at the south-eastern edge of TCE and another parcel of land for waterfront dining and retail would be at the northern side of the proposed reclamation, thus adding interests and vibrancy to the waterfront. This option would produce about 33,000 flats (planned population of about 95 000) for TCE. Adequate land would be reserved for supporting GIC facilities including a sports ground;

Tung Chung West

- (d) for TCW, the theme of “Development and Conservation - A Balance” was proposed with limited reclamation (about 14 ha) to provide additional housing land in TCW in addition to developing some of the existing rural areas. The overall development intensity of TCW would be lower than that of TCE to strike a balance between development and conservation. Building height of the new developments would match with the smooth transition from mountain backdrop in the south to the estuary area of Tung Chung River in the north. To capitalise on the improved accessibility due to the proposed TCW Station and having regard to the committed public housing development at Area 39, higher density developments up to domestic PR 5 and 6 were proposed in the southern part of TCW along Tung Chung Road. Domestic PR 3 would be applicable to the areas adjoining Yat Tung Estate to provide a stepped height profile towards Tung Chung Bay. Developments near the village clusters would be subject to a domestic PR of 1.5 whereas the intensity would be limited to

domestic PR 0.75 in areas near the Tung Chung River estuary;

- (e) the proposed reclamation of 14 ha of land near Ma Wan Chung to the east of Tung Chung Bay would produce more land for residential use and for local improvement works to enhance the maritime character of the Ma Wan Chung Village by preserving the inlet as a permanent harbour. Residential development with domestic PR 3 and 5, local commercial area, waterfront promenade and GIC facilities were proposed within the reclamation area. The reclamation area should avoid mudflat and mangroves. Mitigation measures to minimise the impact on nearby ecologically sensitive areas would be carefully considered. This option would produce about 15 000 flats (planned population of about 43 000);

- (f) conservation related zonings would be provided at the coastline, flank of Tung Chung River, and woodlands extended from the Lantau North Country Park etc. Existing rural village clusters in TCW would be respected so as to maintain their village character. A waterfront promenade in TCW would link up various points of interest including Ma Wan Chung Village, town park and the conservation areas;

Preliminary Technical Assessments

- (g) according to the broad technical assessments, all the initial land use options were technically feasible with appropriate provision of infrastructure and implementation of necessary environmental mitigation measures. Further engineering assessments would be conducted to confirm the technical feasibility during the preparation of Outline Development Plan (ODP) and to work out the detailed population and development requirements with the support of the necessary infrastructures;

[Ms. Christina M. Lee left the meeting at this point.]

Stage 2 PE

- (h) the main objective of the Stage 2 PE was to present to the public the initial land use options formulated on the basis of the views received in Stage 1 PE, to facilitate stakeholders' understanding of and to compare the pros and cons of these options, and to seek broad consensus on the planning direction, scale and area of development for subsequent formulation of the ODP at the later stage of the Study. The Stage 2 PE would be held from 21.5.2013 to 21.7.2013, including briefings to the relevant statutory and advisory bodies, focus group meetings, community workshop, public forum and roving exhibitions; and

Advice Sought

- (i) Members were invited to provide their views on the proposals, including the planning principles and proposed initial land use options for extending Tung Chung New Town.

Question and Discussion Session

41. The Chairman thanked the study team for giving the presentation and invited Members to give their views on the Study. Members had the following questions and comments:

General

- (a) there were major improvements in the study findings and recommendations as compared with the last presentation of the initial findings of the Study to the Board. The direction and approach of the Study was supported;
- (b) the Study should examine the current problems encountered in the existing Tung Chung New Town and take the opportunity of the Tung Chung New Town Extension to properly address those problems. The synergy effect in integrating Tung Chung New Town Extension and the existing Tung Chung New Town to become a livable city should be explored;

- (c) reference should be made to the planning concept and planned population capacity of Tung Chung New Town as recommended in the previous studies;

Proposed Reclamation at TCW

- (d) the proposed reclamation of 14 ha at TCW would involve areas of high ecological value given that it was located at the estuary of Tung Chung River. Would environmental impact assessment (EIA) on the proposed reclamation be undertaken at a later stage;
- (e) the natural coastline at TCW should be preserved. The proposed reclamation at TCW to accommodate a population of about 14,000 at the expense of the natural environment and the integrity of the natural coastlines warranted further consideration. The continuous natural coastline along TCW was an attractive landscape feature for tourists travelling on the 360° cable cars and hence the proposed reclamation could be detrimental to the tourism development in Tung Chung;
- (f) consideration should be given to proceed with one reclamation area in TCE, instead of two proposed reclamation areas in both TCE and TCW. The Study should explore if more development could be accommodated in TCE so that the proposed reclamation at TCW could be removed;
- (g) whether the concept of eco-shoreline would be adopted in re-establishing the natural marine habitats along the coast of the reclaimed land in the reclamation proposals;

Further Development at TCE

- (h) the natural character of Tung Chung River Valley should be better preserved, and thus the scale and intensity of the planned developments in the valley should be reduced. The scale and intensity of the proposed

development at TCE could be increased to compensate for the reduction in planned capacity in the Tung Chung River Valley areas;

- (i) there was no proposed development at the southern side of the proposed TCE MTR station. Consideration should be given to optimize the development potential on the southern side of the proposed TCE MTR station, taking advantage of its accessible and convenient location;

Tuen Mun – Chek Lap Kok Link

- (j) what was the planned use of the reclaimed island to the north-east of the TCE reclamation connected by the Tuen Mun-Chek Lap Kok Link;

Sports Ground in TCE

- (k) why was the size and configuration of the GIC zone designated for the proposed sports ground different under the two initial land use options for TCE;
- (l) noting that the proposed sports ground was located close to the waterfront in the eastern side of the TCE reclamation under both initial land use options, consideration should be given to locate the proposed sports ground further inland in the middle part of the planned high density developments so as to act as visual break and spatial relief for the high density developments;
- (m) consideration should be given to identify other feasible means to mitigate the noise impact of Tuen Mun - Chek Lap Kok Link in the northeast of TCE reclamation. Should the sports ground be no longer required as noise buffer for the residential developments, it could be relocated to other parts of TCE reclamation to provide visual and spatial relief for the high density developments;

Marina in TCE

- (n) what were the justifications on the provision and the scale of the proposed marina in Tung Chung under the “Economic Vibrancy” option. The target users and operation of the proposed marina should be explained;
- (o) there was a concern on the environmental impact of the proposed marina on the water quality of Tai Ho Inlet which was the primary water inlet for Tai Ho Wan with high ecological value;

Town Park in TCW

- (p) noting that the proposed town park in TCW would be built on a small hill, what was the design concept proposed; and

Tung Chung Battery

- (q) the orientation and gun path of Tung Chung Battery should not be blocked noting that high density developments were planned on the TCW reclamation to its north.

[Dr. C.P. Lau, Mr. Clarence W.T. Leung and Mr. H.F. Leung left the meeting at this point.]

42. In response, Mr. Ivan Chung, Ms. Theresa Yeung and Mr. Vincent Lai made the following main points:

General

- (a) according to the Revised Concept Plan for Lantau published in 2007, Tung Chung was a comprehensively planned new town for a total population of about 220,000 with the provision of community and regional facilities. Other than Tung Chung New Town, no substantial growth of a similar scale was planned for the other major settlements in North Lantau in view of the need for nature conservation, air traffic noise impact and the limited

transport and infrastructure capacities;

- (b) Tung Chung was being developed in phases. While the existing and planned population of Tung Chung were about 80,000 and 108,000 respectively, it was the main objective of the Study to comprehensively review the planning and development for the remaining parts of Tung Chung and to identify the development potential and opportunities to extend Tung Chung New Town;

- (c) the major planning issues of Tung Chung New Town, as expressed by local residents and stakeholders during the Stage 1 PE, were the mix and balance of private and public housing, the external connectivity of Tung Chung with other parts of Hong Kong; the internal connectivity within Tung Chung, the provision of more and balanced distribution of community and recreational facilities including a sports ground, and a lack of job and business opportunities for local residents. It was the goal of the Study to integrate the proposed extension areas and the existing Tung Chung New Town with a view to addressing the above planning issues. The major proposals in the initial land use options included two new MTR stations at TCE and TCW; provision of a continuous waterfront promenade connecting TCE and TCW; a more balanced provision and distribution of public and private housing developments and GIC facilities, and the provision of a sports ground in TCE, etc.;

Proposed Reclamation at TCW

- (d) having considered the ecological value of the natural environment nearby, the proposed TCW reclamation was limited to the northeastern part of Tung Chung Bay, which was mainly occupied by man-made seawalls and rocky shores with lower ecological value. The proposed reclamation was located farther away from areas of high ecological value including the mangroves and mudflats in the southern and western sides of the bay. Preliminary assessment indicated that the proposed TCW reclamation would not significantly change the seawater flows within Tung Chung Bay

and would have no adverse ecological impact on the surrounding area. The environmental and ecological impacts of the proposed reclamation would be assessed in details under an EIA conducted for the purpose of the EIA Ordinance at a later stage;

- (e) compared with the proposals of the previous studies, the extent of TCW reclamation had been reduced to 14 ha for a planned population of 14,000 to balance development needs and public aspiration for nature conservation. Without the proposed TCW reclamation, the further development potential at Tung Chung would be severely limited;
- (f) the use of eco-shoreline as a measure to mitigate the environmental impacts of reclamation and to enhance the shore and marine environments could be further examined at the EIA stage;

Further Development at TCE

- (g) the suggestion to adjust the scale and development intensity of the planned developments within Tung Chung River Valley in TCW and TCE would have to be further examined. As a preliminary observation, further increase in the building height and development intensity in the areas might give rise to air ventilation and visual impacts;
- (h) the scope of developing the southern side of the proposed TCE MTR station was limited given that the subject area comprised mainly steep slopes in close proximity to the Country Park. Furthermore, the subject area would likely be exposed to noise impact from the North Lantau Highway and the future Tuen Mun – Chek Lap Kok link and a substantial set back would be required for mitigating the noise problem;

[Mr. F.C. Chan and Mr. C.W. Tse left the meeting at this point.]

Tuen Mun – Chek Lap Kok Link

- (i) the reclaimed island located to the north-west of TCE reclamation was the border crossing facilities for the Hong Kong-Zhuhai-Macao Bridge. The future Tuen Mun – Chek Lap Kok Link would connect the island with Tuen Mun in the north and the North Lantau Highway in the south;
- (j) the Tuen Mun – Chek Lap Kok Link was an authorised road scheme which had been taken as a relevant planning consideration under the Study;

Sports Ground in TCE

- (k) under the two initial land use options for TCE, a 3-hectare site had been reserved for development of a sports ground in accordance with the HKPSG and the requirements of the Leisure and Cultural Services Department (LCSD). The size and configuration of the “G/IC” site designated for the sports ground were different under the two options as there were other types of GIC facilities planned within the same “G/IC” zone and the types of GIC use differed under the two options;
- (l) the location of the proposed sports ground had taken into account the following considerations:
 - (i) the sports ground could serve as a noise buffer between the Tuen Mun-Chek Lap Kok Link and the noise sensitive uses, including the residential developments, in the eastern side of TCE reclamation;
 - (ii) low-rise GIC developments were proposed along the waterfront to maintain a stepped-height profile with building heights decreasing towards the waterfront to maximize views towards the sea;
 - (iii) the location as suggested by Members was closer to the proposed TCE MTR station and had been reserved for high density residential developments, taking advantage of its convenient access to the MTR station; and

- (iv) the provision of promenade and public facilities along the waterfront could enhance the accessibility of waterfront for public enjoyment;
- (m) notwithstanding the above, there was scope for further amendment to the initial land use proposals in formulating the ODP. The feasibility of utilising the sports ground and other low-rise GIC developments as visual and spatial relief for the high density built-up areas in TCE would be further examined in the later stage of the Study;

Marina in TCE

- (n) the proposed marina under the “Economic Vibrancy” option was in response to the suggestion by local residents and stakeholders during the Stage 1 PE, which was intended to promote commercial and tourism development in Tung Chung. According to the initial option, the marina would provide some 350 berths with associated commercial uses. Further investigation of its feasibility and operation would be carried out in the later stage of the Study;
- (o) a detailed EIA would be conducted to assess the environmental impact of the proposed marina, including the impact on the water quality of Tai Ho Inlet, should the marina be recommended for implementation;

[Ms. Anita W.T. Ma and Mr. Stephen H.B. Yau left the meeting at this point.]

Town Park in TCW

- (p) it was proposed to make use of an existing knoll to create a town park with special character to provide more open space for public enjoyment. An example of park facilities on undulating grounds was Hong Kong Park. LCSD had no objection to the town park proposal and its detailed design would be subject to further study; and

Tung Chung Battery

- (q) the provision of air paths and view corridors would be considered in detailed planning of the residential developments to the north of the Tung Chung Battery taking account of its orientation and gun path.

43. A Member reiterated that the necessity for the proposed TCW reclamation should be seriously considered given its likely impact on the natural coastline and landscape quality of the area. In response, Mr. Ivan Chung said that the need for the TCW reclamation would be further examined in the next stage of the Study, taking into account the views of the public solicited under the Stage 2 PE.

44. The Chairman said that Members had expressed views on the initial land use options for the Tung Chung New Town Extension. The study team was requested to take into account the views expressed by Members at the next stage of the Study. The Chairman thanked the representatives of PlanD and the Consultants for attending the meeting. They all left the meeting at this point.